Prepared by the Center for Curriculum Redesign’s Research team:
Emma Fortier, Katie Dunn, Charles Fadel

CCR is deeply grateful, for their trust and support, to the:

© 2022 Center for Curriculum Redesign - All Rights Reserved
# Table of Contents

**Executive Summary**  
4

**Introduction**  
6

**Identity, Agency and Purpose**  
7  
- Identity  
  - Competencies Supporting Identity  
8  
- Agency  
  - Competencies Supporting Agency  
10  
- Purpose  
  - Competencies Supporting Purpose  
13

**Motivation and Beyond**  
15

**Conclusion**  
16

**Appendix A**  
17  
- A Note on the Ikigai Model  
17
Executive Summary

The Center for Curriculum Redesign’s (CCR) 4-Dimensional Framework describes key dimensions of successful education beyond Knowledge - namely Skills, Character and Meta-Learning\(^1\). These Competencies have been broken down into specific sub-competencies to enhance their measurability and clarity. However, for the sake of student personalization (aka learner-centricity), these essential Competencies can also be built up and recombined into broader ideas—for instance: Identity, Agency, and Purpose. This paper serves to illustrate a crosswalk between CCR’s Competencies and these constructs, showcasing a practical guide to how large abstract ideas can be broken down using the 4D Framework to enhance concrete teachability.

First, a brief summary of the current literature around Identity, Agency, and Purpose is provided; the debate surrounding these constructs is presented; and CCR’s perspective is described (Table 1). In each case, the more active choice is selected to promote a learner-centered approach further in line with the goals of education. This is not to say that serendipity does not play a role in how a life unfolds, how an identity is forged, or how a purpose is built. Rather, serendipity should not be depended on to solely create any of these constructs. Furthermore, as this paper focuses on actions individuals can take to cultivate all three constructs, there is very little advice to give if one expects Purpose and Identity to knock down their door.

Table 1. Synthesis of the debate surrounding Identity and Purpose. In each case, we find that Agency is the distinguishing factor. While we acknowledge that “passive” constraints such as initial conditions may have a significant role in shaping Identity and Purpose, CCR believes the role of education is to empower learners to proceed from those starting points, and thus takes the definition in the “active view.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Passive view (Less Agency)</th>
<th>Active view (More Agency)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>One’s “true self” is latent, waiting to be discovered or activated</td>
<td>Individuals create and shape their own identity across a lifetime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>Purpose finds a person, through life events; one day it is “discovered”</td>
<td>Individuals build their own purpose across a lifetime</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\) https://curriculumredesign.org/framework/
Second, the paper demonstrates how the 4D Framework can assist learners develop all three of the above constructs, by describing how the top three related Competencies support each construct (Figure 1). The 4D framework thus provides the concrete skills and, therefore, building blocks youth need to develop Identity, Agency and Purpose—and more broadly, other such abstract constructs related to motivation and well-being.

**Figure 1. Mapping of Competencies to Identity, Agency, and Purpose.** Bands’ widths indicate the strength of the connection between each Competency (left) and associated construct (right) based on a literature review. While it is clear that more pieces of the framework support Identity, Agency, and Purpose, this paper will focus on the top three Competencies for each.

---

Introduction

The timing of this paper is not a coincidence. As many researchers have noted, there has been a recent shift in the timing of a young person’s entrance into adulthood.\(^3\) Previous generations saw adolescents transition neatly from higher education, to careers, to parenthood.\(^4\) In each of these phases, Identity and, to some extent, Purpose, were more firmly defined for individuals. Now, this pathway, this timing, and these roles are much more unstable and porous. As University of Chicago’s Consortium on School Research notes, “this delay into adulthood has led to greater role ambiguity and a greater emphasis on individuality in identity development.”\(^5\) COVID-19 has further exacerbated this ambiguity, and, if the pattern holds, each generation will continue to tear down and rebuild what a meaningful life means to them as the path from adolescence to adulthood becomes increasingly more complex. Without a strong sense of Identity, Agency, or Purpose, today’s youth run the risk of feeling increasingly helpless in a volatile and unpredictable future. Thus, this paper is particularly suited to address the urgent needs and increasing murkiness as young people negotiate these three constructs.

It is important to note that all three of these constructs are strongly tied to both an individual and to the society, culture, and surroundings that individual is embedded in. This paper will largely focus on the individual and their role in society.

Informed by the latest research, this paper will outline which Competencies best enable learners to build, sustain, and express Identity, Agency, and Purpose, given the nuances and tripwires of each particular developmental process. It will become clear that these Competencies and Subcompetencies are critical for the development and stability of all three constructs.

This is not to say that Identity, Agency and Purpose are only the results of piecing together a handful of Competencies—nor that the three Competencies noted are the only pieces of the 4D Framework relevant to the concept at hand. Rather, the 4D framework provides a powerful inroad to these seemingly abstract and multifaceted constructs. By framing Identity, Agency


\(^4\) Albeit, only for white, upper-middle class Americans.

and Purpose through the lens specific practicable skills, Competencies can create a lever to uplift and access their development in and beyond education.

**Identity, Agency and Purpose**

Perhaps intuitively, these three concepts are related.

With Identity, a student understands themselves and has a sense of self: I know who I am, and my place in society. They are able to understand that they are simultaneously a separate entity from those around them and a part of many groups whose membership can come from both internal sources (e.g. “I see myself as a swimmer.”) and external sources (e.g. “I am seen as a Black American.”)

Agency allows an individual to see how they and their identity can impact the world around them: I can do something (e.g. “I can join the swim team if I want to”).

Purpose helps an individual direct that agency towards something personally meaningful: I can do something that matters (e.g. “I will help others learn how to swim”).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CCR Term</th>
<th>OED Definition6</th>
<th>Associated Terms and Constructs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Identity</strong></td>
<td>Who a person is</td>
<td>Self-understanding; self-concept; selfhood/personhood; daimon; Moi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency</strong></td>
<td>The ability or capacity to act</td>
<td>Growth Mindset; self-efficacy; self-esteem; influence; ability; autonomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
<td>The reason for which something is done or made, or for which it exists</td>
<td>Ambition; passion; intentions; interests</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Identity**

Research indicates that there are two schools of thought when it comes to the development of Identity: either it is discovered, or it is created. While the two options may seem similar, they produce very different images of Identity.

---

The former describes an individual waiting for their “true self,” to be found.\(^7\) This language depicts a passive individual depending on an external event to provide their identity.\(^8\) It also emphasizes a predetermined nature of self,\(^9\) as the idea of a true self does not allow for the evolution of Identity without placing a value judgment on one Identity being \textit{superior} to the other, instead of just different.

Conversely, the idea that Identity is \textit{created} imagines an individual taking an active role in the construction of their Identity.\(^10\) This depiction provides an individual with more Agency in the development of their Identity as it emphasizes their role and control in the process. This language also allows for the potential to craft multifaceted Identities for a variety of situations, and evolve each Identity across a lifetime.\(^11\)

This paper will move forward with the assumption that while Identity can be both created and discovered, the former will be more impactful from the perspective of an instructor and an individual looking to cultivate Identity. The philosophical choice to favor the Agency of individuals and the efficacy of the education system will help learners acquire the tools needed along the way.

\textbf{Competencies Supporting Identity}

The three most significant Competencies for Identity development and expression are Metacognition, Curiosity and Courage.

\textit{Metacognition}

Unsurprisingly, Metacognition provides an effective inroad to the creation of Identity. In particular, Metacognition can aid students as they face one of Identity’s central tripwires: navigating and selecting between a multitude of possibilities.

Often referred to as performativity, this idea relates to the fact that individuals “[create or present] themselves by playing different roles on different stages to different audiences,”\(^12\),

\begin{itemize}
  \item Ibid.
  \item Ibid.
  \item Ibid.
  \item Ibid.
\end{itemize}
meaning that individuals quite literally perform their identity, and that performance can look different depending on the audience (e.g. code switching). Consider: how does the presentation and expression of identity change or shift when around family versus friends? Co-workers versus college friends? How has it changed from adolescence to young adulthood to midlife?

Metacognition can provide students with the tools to reconcile these varying refractions of their identities: to flexibly adapt their identities to different contexts,\textsuperscript{13} to observe and regulate their internal states as they navigate these spaces,\textsuperscript{14} and to reflect on the different aspects of their identity that are emphasized (willingly or unwillingly) in a variety of contexts.\textsuperscript{15}

One research consortium refers to this reconciliation as an integrated Identity, which involves the “process of internally integrating different aspects of self (e.g., beliefs, mindsets, goals, roles, experiences) that allows for a sense of continuity with what one has experienced in the past and future possibilities for potential change and growth.”\textsuperscript{16} Metacognition is a key element of this integration across selves and across time to create a stable sense of self.

\textit{Curiosity}

Curiosity plays a significant role before and during the development of identity. Research into identity emphasizes the importance of an exploration phase and how that period of exploration can impact the level of satisfaction, confidence, and firmness once an individual “commits” to an identity.\textsuperscript{17}

In other words, if an individual is only exposed to X, Y, and Z identities during this exploration phase (through friends, family, media, etc.), then they only have pieces of X, Y and Z to choose from as they develop their own identity. If, on the other hand, an individual is exposed to a whole alphabet of identities, they have far more combinations and inspiration to pull from.

While this phase of exploration typically is associated with adolescence and young adulthood, it can reoccur later in life, if a “new” or updated identity is better suited to one’s ever-changing contexts. In line with the idea that Identities are malleable and can be created, it will thus continue to grow across a lifetime of new situations.

\textsuperscript{13} MET7: Thinking and adapting flexibly
\textsuperscript{14} MET6: Practicing awareness and regulation of internal state
\textsuperscript{15} MET1: Reflecting on processes, achievements, learning and/or identity
The development of Curiosity can greatly assist individuals as they explore these alternatives – and to prompt them to explore these alternatives. The seed of Curiosity can urge individuals explore different ways of living and thinking,¹⁸ and instructors can help learners cultivate this Curiosity by exposing them to different walks of life and new situations.¹⁹

**Courage**

Undoubtedly, it takes Courage to express some facets of identity, and to commit to that expression even in spaces that are uncomfortable – or even violent – towards that expression.²⁰ Developing this skill is particularly relevant to empowering marginalized groups and improving student achievement through critical consciousness.²¹

Courage can also help individuals navigate a related tripwire of identity: the feeling of *too many* available identities. Also known as omnipotentiality, facing this uncertainty can cause an individual to end up frozen, in stasis, unable to make a move forward or backward, lest they commit to a “wrong” version of themselves and close off other opportunities.²²

It requires Courage, then, to make a definitive move: to purposefully step in any direction, even if it means a longer journey.²³ Making this choice lies at the boundary of Identity and Agency.

**Agency**

Much like Identity, Agency often begins with the self; in particular, with self-Agency, or the realization that an individual has control over their own actions and behaviors.²⁴ This process can begin even before the concept of self-awareness, developing as individuals observe casual connections between their actions and changes in the environment. Also called self-regulation, self-Agency empowers an individual to exert influence over themselves and is particularly important during early childhood development.²⁵ Self-Agency allows an individual to understand what they do and do not have control over and how to work within those confines.

---

¹⁸ CUR3: Seeking different perspectives to broaden understanding
¹⁹ CUR2: Seeking out novelty and trying new things
²⁰ COU1: Pursuing ambitious goals despite social, financial, physical or emotional risk to self
²³ COU3: Engaging with others in a vulnerable way
²⁵ Ibid.
For example, while an individual perhaps cannot control that they feel an emotion, they can control how they express and act upon that emotion. They can be in control, instead of letting their emotions control them.

When Agency is expanded beyond the self, a similar logic applies. Where can they exert influence over themselves, others, and the situation at large? How can they take control and not allow themselves to be buffeted by the wants and whims of others? Of course, the ability to execute this control is potentially limited, especially as an adolescent.

It is perhaps most apparent in Agency – though it is true for all three constructs – that structural factors significantly impact how an individual can express their Agency. Socio-economic background, childhood, family experiences, and culture can all have a substantial impact on agentic orientation and agentic possibility. All of these factors are often outside of an individual’s control – particularly as an adolescent. Understanding how these variables impact Agency can help an individual identify where they can most productively exert influence for positive impact.

**Competencies Supporting Agency**

The three most important Competencies for the development and exertion of Agency are Growth Mindset, Metacognition and Courage.

**Growth Mindset**

Growth Mindset is often synonymous with Agency, as both deal in similar spaces: self-efficacy, self esteem, and the locus of control being firmly with the individual.

In particular, Agency and Growth Mindset overlap in the sense that both must be intentional. While this does not imply that an individual must have a grand plan or goals, they cannot simply cannot wander into Agency either—it is an intentional exertion. Cultivating Growth Mindset is an effective strategy to discover and flex this intentionality in a wider variety of contexts, particularly those where one is more likely to feel helpless.

---


28 Ibid.

29 GRO1: Believing in one’s agency and having high self-efficacy
In a similar vein, Growth Mindset helps cultivate Agency by placing the responsibility and possibility of growth in the hands of the individual. Seeing events and abilities as predetermined or static takes away from an individual’s Agency, and Growth Mindset deliberately works against this sense of inevitability – instead providing an individual with the knowledge of their own power and capacity to change both what is around them and what is inside of them.

**Metacognition**

Paradoxically, Agency is not a stable fixture: it can ebb and flow depending on the context. Metacognition provides individuals with the tools to reflect upon those contexts and determine which are most effective for exercising Agency: at some times, exerting Agency can have major positive results, while others have limited or diminishing returns, and Metacognition (along with Critical Thinking) helps prioritize the most relevant cases for the individual.

Yet it would be wrong to suggest that an individual’s Agency is fully subject to the whims of these contexts. Metacognition further prepares people to not only adapt to but also influence the changing environments themselves. For instance, Metacognitive awareness of a multifaceted Identity can elevate the parts best suited to the task to the fore or determine how each action can influence surroundings to be more conducive to exercising Agency in a positive feedback loop.

**Courage**

Of course, just because an individual *has* Agency does not mean they will use it. The ability to exert influence and flex this Agency often requires Courage. During a case study into the effectiveness of developing Agency in the classroom, one study notes, the “students’ growing development of agency grew from within as they felt more self-assured and brave enough to express their beliefs. [One participant] expressed this sentiment when she described a growing confidence in articulating her views. She proudly commented, “I learned to speak with no fear.” The ability to speak up and out and to act in the face of fear is a direct result of

---

31 GRO1: Believing in one’s agency and having a high self-efficacy
33 MET7: Thinking and adapting flexibly
Courage,[35] thus demonstrating that Courage is a necessary tool (though not sufficient alone—Resilience would be needed to sustain it) to access and improve Agency.

**Purpose**

Similar to Identity, researchers and philosophers remain split on whether Purpose is discovered or created.[36] Researcher John Coleman describes this first conception well:

> “On social media, I often see an inspiring quotation attributed to Mark Twain: “The two most important days in your life are the day you are born and the day you find out why.” It neatly articulates what I’ll call the “Hollywood version” of purpose. Like Neo in The Matrix or Rey in Star Wars, we’re all just moving through life waiting until fate delivers a higher calling to us.”[37]

Here, Coleman accurately describes the pervasive perception that individuals play a passive role in the development of their Purpose—that Purpose finds *them*, not the other way around.

Conversely, the depiction that individuals *create* Purpose places them in an active role. Coleman stresses the importance of building Purpose and playing an active role in seeking out that Purpose, and both the research and popular wisdom such as the Ikigai model (Appendix A) echo this emphasis. Additionally, a person can derive a sense of Purpose in disparate ways, which may shift over the course of a lifetime. Thus, just as with Identity, this paper will proceed under the assumption that Agency allows Purpose to be both created and multifaceted.

A sense of Purpose can provide a source of intrinsic motivation: a powerful force that can propel an individual through months and years, even as an individual’s Purposes change.[38] While extrinsic motivation is shaped by rewards, whether they are tangible or intangible (e.g. money or grades versus praise), intrinsic motivation “is animated by personal enjoyment, interest, or pleasure.”[39] Traditional education provides plenty of extrinsic motivation (which is undoubtedly helpful for learning), but these external incentives do not contribute to an individual’s sense of Purpose.

---

[35] COU2: Standing up for one’s values
[37] Ibid.

© 2022 Center for Curriculum Redesign - All Rights Reserved
Competencies Supporting Purpose

The three most critical Competencies for the development of Purpose(s) are Curiosity, Metacognition, and Resilience.

Curiosity

By and large, there are two genres of Purpose: self-interested and self-transcendent. The former refers to a Purpose that largely benefits the self (e.g. an enjoyable task or activity), while the latter is rooted in benefiting others or working towards something larger than oneself. Though both can technically be considered Purposes, self-transcendent motivations have been shown to be more effective in motivating learners and workers.40

That being said, the road to a self-transcendent motivation can be paved by self-interest. As individuals are often interested in experiencing self-transcendent purpose, leveraging Curiosity can help target both motivations simultaneously. Curiosity is a powerful tool in helping learners find what interests them and what sparks their passion – a spark that may lead them towards a self-transcendent Purpose (which can be further supported through other Competencies, such as Leadership).41

Metacognition

As a learner grows and matures, their Purpose will likely evolve and expand.42 Metacognition allows an individual to recognize those shifting priorities and assess their permanence or impermanence (e.g. is this an interest to me because of its novelty, or does it have the potential to drive my life?). Metacognition also equips an individual with the skills to adapt to those ever evolving and pivotal Purposes.43 As these skills are integrated and expand beyond an individual’s Purpose, similar constructs in Leadership can further develop this facet of Purpose.

Resilience

Resilience can be thought of as the set of qualities that allow one to overcome obstacles. While having a Purpose can increase the bearability or effectiveness of an activity or pursuit, it does

41 CUR4: Actively pursuing one’s own interests and passions
43 MET7: Thinking and adapting flexibly

© 2022 Center for Curriculum Redesign - All Rights Reserved
not necessarily increase an individual’s enjoyment of that pursuit.\textsuperscript{44} It is a common misconception that a Purpose in life will make every aspect of their work or life enjoyable – and if it is \textit{not} enjoyable, it must not be their Purpose. Unfortunately, this is not the case. Instead, a Purpose – particularly one that transcends the individual – serves only to make those less enjoyable tasks more effective and/or bearable. As one researcher notes, “trashmen [who appreciate how their work improves society] do not find trash more appealing, but they collect it more effectively.”\textsuperscript{45}

In this way, Resilience is crucial to the sustainability of a Purpose – whether that be persevering through the less enjoyable parts of life to reap the rewards later,\textsuperscript{46} or finding that guiding star to look to when times are tough (or boring!).\textsuperscript{47}

\section*{Motivation and Beyond}

There is, however, more to this puzzle – or perhaps it \textit{is} the ultimate puzzle: motivation. Motivation is fundamentally intertwined with learning, allowing people to focus their attention on a given outcome.

Identity, Agency and Purpose are three of the necessary keystones to understanding and developing Motivation, but many questions still remain. How are these four pieces related? Where are they dependent? Can they be effectively separated out and well-defined? How can these definitions help instructors, administrators, and jurisdictions develop motivated students? What other pieces are missing? These questions and more will be explored in a follow-on report on Motivation.

While some contend that Motivation simply lies at the intersection of Identity, Agency, and Purpose, the full picture is almost certainly far more complex. It is worth noting that although these three constructs are important, they highlight intrinsic and individualistic principles. Learning is not rooted in an individual alone; nor must it stem from intrinsic drives alone. The Competencies likewise support and uplift various different ideals of learning: from community-building to empathy and equity.\textsuperscript{48}

\textsuperscript{45} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{46} RES5: Preserving through challenges but seeking help when needed
\textsuperscript{47} RES4: Orienting to a meaning or purpose
Conclusion

Identity, Agency, and Purpose are at the crux of both an individual’s development and the educational system’s potential to help learners. Without careful development of these constructs, individuals are at risk of feeling deep dissatisfaction with life and feeling woefully unprepared for a rapidly-changing future. The 4D Framework can provide effective inroads to accessing these abstract concepts. Different Competencies can act as levers to manipulate and develop each of these pieces, and it is through an explicit skills building of Competencies that students can realize these essential developmental tasks.

In the research, these concepts are intertwined and imprecise. They are knotted together – dependent on one another to retain their integrity and their essence. All together, these constructs create a powerful cycle that can feed back into itself – to create more Agency and a greater sense of Purpose and Identity...or less and less of each. *K-12 education is an ideal time to intercept and reverse this negative feedback loop and give learners essential tools to walk forward with greater confidence, towards the rest of their life.*
A Note on the Ikigai Model

In the US in particular, students are admonished to “do what they love”. It may be laudable, but is that enough? (and realistic?). Shouldn’t there be a concern about a modicum of financial independence as well? Proficiency? Helping society?

The Ikigai model can be a useful tool for people to imagine and create Purpose. It also provides an apt summary of how CCR interprets Purpose and how various Competencies can help develop different pieces of the Ikigai model. If an individual can identify where they are lacking in the Ikigai model, then there are a myriad of Subcompetencies that can be leveraged.
For example, “What You Love” and “What You are Good At” largely reflect a Purpose rooted in self-interest, and can therefore be explored through Growth Mindset 4 (Understanding one’s current strengths and weaknesses) and Curiosity 4 (Actively pursuing one’s own interests and passions), as mentioned above.

If, on the other hand, an individual is struggling with “What the World Needs,” Leadership 6 (Contributing to the broader group or community) and Resilience 4 (Orienting to a meaning or purpose) will be of use.

“What You can be Paid For” represents a structural constraint that exists outside of the individual and in society. By including the ability to earn a living as a core element of the Ikigai Model, it is in turn mandating that “laborer” or “worker” must be a central tenet of an individual’s Identity – which, indeed, it must be in our current social system. Thus, Creativity 5 (Realizing ideas while recognizing constraints) will likely be most useful to individuals who are struggling with incorporating this final piece of the Ikigai model into their lives.